arXiv:hep-ph/9812353v1 14 Dec 1998

ON BELL'S LOCALITY TESTS WITH NEUTRAL KAONS

F. Benatti
Dipartimento di Fisica Teorica, Università di Trieste
Strada Costiera 11, 34014 Trieste, Italy
and
Istituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare, Sezione di Trieste

R. Floreanini
Istituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare, Sezione di Trieste
Dipartimento di Fisica Teorica, Università di Trieste
Strada Costiera 11, 34014 Trieste, Italy

Abstract

We present some general considerations on possible experimental tests of Bell's locality in the neutral kaon system, and comment on the recent literature on the topic.

Recently, new reports discussing possible tests of the condition of Bell's locality have appeared.[1, 2] They propose a direct experimental check of a "new" Bell-like inequality for the system of correlated neutral kaons coming from the decay of a ϕ-meson.

In this note, we would like to present a few basic considerations concerning some aspects of possible tests of local deterministic extensions of quantum mechanics using the K^0-$\overline{K^0}$ system, that seem to have been overlooked in the works quoted above. In particular, we want to emphasize that: *i)* the proposed "new" Bell's inequality has already been discussed before, although in slightly different form;[3, 4] *ii)* no direct experimental test of this inequality is presently possible at available experimental setups, while actual data on a different test of Bell's locality proposed in [5] will be available soon. We stress that the Bell inequality discussed in [5] is completely general within the stated assumption of stochastic independence of correlated kaons decays.

The two neutral kaons that originate from the decay of a ϕ-meson, although flying apart with opposite momentum (in the ϕ rest frame), remain nevertheless quantum mechanically correlated in a way that is very similar to the entanglement of two spin-1/2 particles in a singlet state. This allows performing fundamental tests on the behaviour of entangled systems by studying the time-evolution of certain observables of the two kaons (for a discussion, see [3, 6, 7] and references therein).

Typical observables that can be studied are double decay probabilities $\mathcal{P}(f_1,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2)$, *i.e.* the probabilities that one kaon decays into a final state f_1 at proper time τ_1, while the other kaon decays into the final state f_2 at proper time τ_2. The requirement of the condition of Bell's locality (see later) results into certain inequalities that the probabilities $\mathcal{P}$ should satisfy (Bell's inequalities). A general introduction to these topics can be found in Refs.[8-11].

Notice that these decay probabilities $\mathcal{P}(f_1,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2)$ obviously differ from the more often considered decay rates $\Gamma(f_1,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2)$.[12, 13] Nevertheless, they can easily be expressed in terms of the latter, as clearly discussed in the second reference of [5] (see also [14, 15]). In this respect, the probabilities $\mathcal{P}(f_1,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2)$ are perfectly measurable quantities, related to the actual experimental counting of the partial occurance of the various final decay states for the two kaons. Finally, the overall normalization of the probabilities $\mathcal{P}$ (*i.e.* a factor taking care of the absolute branching ratio for the various decay channels) is irrelevant for the considerations leading to the derivation of the Bell's inequalities (for details, see [9, 5]).

In deriving these inequalities, one assumes that the system of the two neutral kaons can be fully described by a set of variables $\{\lambda\}$. Then, for the average probability $\mathcal{P}(f_1,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2)$ one explicitly has:

$$\mathcal{P}(f_1,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2)=\int d\lambda\,\rho(\lambda)\,p_\lambda(f_1,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2)\ , \tag{1}$$

where $\rho(\lambda)$ is a normalized probability density characterizing the ensemble of initial ϕ particles and, for fixed $\{\lambda\}$, $p_\lambda(f_1,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2)$ is a well-defined probability of detecting a final decay state (f_1,τ_1) for one of the two kaons and a final decay state (f_2,τ_2) for the second one. It is important to observe that, since no assumption have been made on the set $\{\lambda\}$, this description is very general, and surely can be made to agree with the results of ordinary quantum mechanics.

On the contrary, the hypothesis of Bell's locality adds a further condition. It is based on the observation that the decays of the two kaons coming from a ϕ-meson are localized events, usually very well spatially separated; one is then led to consider a description where the joint probability $p_\lambda(f_1,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2)$ is naturally expressed in a product form:

$$p_\lambda(f_1,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2) = p_\lambda(f_1,\tau_1;-,\tau_2)\ p_\lambda(-,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2)\ , \tag{2}$$

where $p_\lambda(f_1,\tau_1;-,\tau_2)$ is the probability density of detecting a final state (f_1,τ_1) for one of the kaons and any state $(-,\tau_2)$ for the second one, and similarly for $p_\lambda(-,\tau_1;f_2,\tau_2)$. The condition of Bell's locality in (2) leads to measurable consequences that can be experimentally tested.

In particular, by further assuming that the decay of one kaon is stochastically independent from the decay of the second one, from (2) one easily derives the following inequality:

$$\mathcal{P}(f_3,\tau;f_2,\tau) - \mathcal{P}(f_3,\tau;f_1,\tau) \leq \mathcal{P}(f_1,\tau;f_2,\tau)\ . \tag{3}$$

As stressed in [5], this inequality is not satisfied by all theories describing the two kaons in terms of the variables $\{\lambda\}$; indeed, in deriving (3) from (2), one (implicitly) needs to assume the absence of variables λ that, without violating Bell's locality (2), might nevertheless correlate the two decays. This further assumption is however unavoidable if one uses the standard effective two-dimensional theory to model the K^0-$\overline{K^0}$ system:[16, 13] this choice is the only one compatible with the description of the final decay states as actual asymptotic particles, and therefore directly accessible to the experiment.

The final decay states in (3) are totally arbitrary and can be chosen at will. (This freedom directly corresponds to the choice of the photon polarizations in conventional Bell's inequality tests.[8-11]) When f_1, f_2 are taken to be two-pion states and f_3 a semileptonic state, from (3) one deduces [5]

$$\Big|\mathcal{P}(\pi^-\ell^+\nu,\tau;2\pi^0,\tau) - \mathcal{P}(\pi^-\ell^+\nu,\tau;\pi^+\pi^-,\tau)\Big| \leq \mathcal{P}(2\pi^0,\tau;\pi^+\pi^-,\tau)\ . \tag{4}$$

A similar relation holds when the semileptonic state $\pi^-\ell^+\nu$ is substituted with $\pi^+\ell^-\bar{\nu}$.

The various joint probabilities in (4) can be computed using standard particle physics techniques and the usual effective phenomenological description of the neutral kaon system, allowing CP as well as CPT and $\Delta S = \Delta Q$ violating effects. It turns out that the particular choice of the final states above allows to express (4) only in terms of the parameter ε', that describes direct CP violating effects in the 2π final states:

$$\big|\mathcal{R}e(\varepsilon')\big| \leq 3\,|\varepsilon'|^2\ . \tag{5}$$

In practice, the assumption of Bell's locality (2) for the system of correlated neutral kaons coming from the decay of a ϕ predicts that ε' must satisfy the condition (5). It should be stressed that ignoring CP violations in decay processes, as done in all discussions on Bell's inequalities in the K^0-$\overline{K^0}$ system, would reduce (5) to a trivial identity. The parameter ε'

is accessible to the experiment, which makes even more transparent that the inequality (4) involve measurable quantities. Any experimental determination of this parameter, in any actual setup, not necessarily involving correlated kaons, would automatically be a check of Bell's locality, within the assumption of stochastic independence of kaon decays.

Let us point out that (5) is not a test on the theoretical framework in which the parameter ε' can be estimated.[13, 17] As any test, also the ones based on the inequality (5) are significant only when they give a negative result, saying that Bell's inequality (4) is violated. Only in this case, one is able to experimentally exclude a large set of local deterministic extensions of quantum mechanics. If the experimental data turn out to be compatible with a vanishing value for ε' (result predicted by the so-called superweak phenomenological model [18]), than simply the inequality (5) would not provide any criterion to exclude those extensions of quantum mechanics, and one would need to look for different tests. However, if the experiments[†] confirm the theoretical estimates, which roughly predict a value of order 10^{-6} for the modulus of ε', with a phase close to $\pi/4$, then the condition (5) will be violated by several orders of magnitude, resulting in one of the best tests of Bell's locality.

The discussion that led the authors of [1, 2] to the derivation of their "new" Bell's inequality follows very closely the considerations presented so far. Indeed, for their final analysis they use the very same inequality in (3), although the final decay states f_1, f_2 and f_3 are now replaced by suitable states, obtained by making the kaons interact with a slab of material; further, in their analysis CP conservation is assumed. This idea of using the so-called regeneration phenomena for a direct experimental test of Bell's inequalities in a ϕ-factory has been already considered and analyzed in detail in [3, 4]. There, a test of Bell's locality was reduced to a measure of the real part of the regeneration parameter η; a very similar idea is proposed as "new" in [1, 2].

Further, as pointed out also in [3, 4], it is technically very difficult to place a regeneration slab close enough to the e^+- e^- beam in order to actually perform the proposed Bell's locality test; the only practical way out is to use the walls of the actual beam-pipe of the accelerator as a regeneration slab: this is indeed sufficently close to the ϕ-decay vertex to allow proper identification of the K_S mesons, before their decay. However, this possibility would put some restrictions on the class of possible local-deterministic extensions of quantum mechanics that can be excluded by that experimental setup: in particular, one is again forced to assume the stochastic independence of kaon decays.

In conclusion, for the forseeable future the only direct test of Bell's inequality in the neutral kaon system that can be actually performed remains the measure of the phenomenological parameter ε'. A non-vanishing value for this parameter in agreement with the theoretical predictions would allow the exclusion of a wide class of local deterministic extensions of quantum mechanics with an accuracy never reached in the past in any direct experimental tests of Bell's locality.

[†] The results of the fixed target experiments KTEV at Fermilab and NA48 at CERN on the measure of $\mathcal{R}e(\varepsilon'/\varepsilon)$ are expected soon, while the KLOE apparatus at the DAΦNE ϕ-factory in Frascati will start collecting data in the near future.

REFERENCES

1. B. Ancochea, A. Bramon and M. Nowakowski, Bell-inequalities for $K^0\overline{K^0}$ pairs from ϕ-resonance decays, `hep-ph/9811404`
2. A. Bramon and M. Nowakowski, Bell-inequalities for entangled pairs of neutral kaons, `hep-ph/9811406`
3. A. Di Domenico, Nucl. Phys. **B450** (1995) 293
4. A. Di Domenico, in *Workshop on K Physics*, L. Iconomidou-Fayard, ed., (Editions Frontieres, Gif-sur-Yvette (France), 1997)
5. F. Benatti and R. Floreanini, Phys. Rev. D **57** (1998) 1332 and `hep-ph/9712274`
6. G. Ghirardi, R. Grassi and T. Weber, in the Proceedings of the *Workshop on Physics and Detectors for DAΦNE*, G. Pancheri, ed., (INFN-LNF, Frascati, 1991)
7. P.H. Eberhard, Nucl. Phys. **B398** (1993) 155
8. J. Bell, *Speakable and Unspeakable in Quantum Mechanics*, (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1987)
9. J.F. Clauser and M.A. Horne, Phys. Rev. D **10** (1974) 526
10. J.F. Clauser and A. Shimony, Rep. Prog. Phys. **41** (1978) 1881
11. M. Redhead, *Incompleteness, Nonlocality and Realism*, (Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1987)
12. See: C.D. Buchanan, R. Cousins, C. Dib, R.D. Peccei and J. Quackenbush, Phys. Rev. D **45** (1992) 4088, and references therein
13. L. Maiani, in *The Second DaΦne Physics Handbook*, L. Maiani, G. Pancheri and N. Paver, eds., (INFN, Frascati, 1995)
14. F. Benatti and R. Floreanini, Phys. Lett. **B 401** (1997) 337
15. F. Benatti and R. Floreanini, Nucl. Phys. **B 511** (1998) 550
16. T.D. Lee and C.S. Wu, Ann. Rev. Nucl. Sci. **16** (1966) 511
17. For a recent review, see: S. Bertolini, M. Fabbrichesi and J.O. Eeg, Estimating ε'/ε, `hep-ph/9802405`
18. L. Wolfenstein, Phys. Rev. Lett. **13** (1964) 562